Divided We Fail:

Improving Completion and Closing Racial Gaps in California’s Community Colleges

Colleen Moore
Institute for Higher Education Leadership & Policy

Community College League of California
2011 Legislative Conference
January 23, 2011

California State University, Sacramento
Context and Methods

• Today’s imperative: better outcomes with fewer resources
• Must close achievement gaps
  – CCC serves 80% of blacks and Latinos
  – Latino % of working-age pop. from 34% to 50% by 2040
  – 16% of working-age Latino adults have a college degree (associate or higher), compared to 50% of white adults
• Studied 2003-04 cohort of entering credit students
• Tracked degree/certificate-seekers over 6 years (enrolled in > 6 semester credits in first year)
• More than 250,000 students
• Focus on progression - “milestones” and achievement gaps
Too Few Students Reach Milestones on the Road to Degree Completion

4 in 10 completed one year of college credits

6 Years after enrolling, 70% had not completed anything

Intermediate Milestones

Retained 2nd Term: 73%
Retained 2nd Year: 56%
12+ College-Level Credits: 61%
30+ College-Level Credits: 40%
Transfer Curriculum: 15%

Certificate: 5%
Associate Degree: 11%
Transferred Curriculum: 23%
Any Completion: 31%

Note: students can be double-counted in the certificate, associate degree, and transfer measures.
Latino and Black Students Less Likely than White and Asian Students to Reach Milestones

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Intermediate Milestones</th>
<th>Completion</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Retained 2nd Year</td>
<td>Overall completion rate lower for black and Latino students</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12+ College-Level Credits</td>
<td>Latinos half as likely as whites to transfer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30+ College-Level Credits</td>
<td>Black students especially unlikely to complete transfer curriculum</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transfer Curriculum</td>
<td>White</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Certificate</td>
<td>Asian-Pacific Islander</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Associate Degree</td>
<td>Black</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transferred</td>
<td>Latino</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Any Completion</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: students can be double-counted in the certificate, associate degree, and transfer measures
Under-Represented Minority Students are a Smaller Share of Completers than of Degree Seekers

Degree Seekers

- White, 40%
- Latino, 34%
- Black, 9%
- API, 18%

Completers

- White, 48%
- Latino, 23%
- Black, 7%
- API, 22%

Latinos were 1/3 of degree-seekers but < 1/4 of completers
Demographics are Not Destiny:
Colleges of Similar Size and Demographic Profile Produce Very Different Outcomes
Transfer Doesn’t Mean Completing Two Years of Credit, Especially for Black Students

- Less than ½ of transfers completed at least 60 transferable credits (including math and English).
- Black students especially unlikely to complete a transfer curriculum or degree.
- While Latinos were the least likely to transfer, those who did were more likely to complete a transfer curriculum or degree.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>All Transfers</th>
<th>White</th>
<th>API</th>
<th>Black</th>
<th>Latino</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>% of Transfers that Completed Transfer Curriculum</td>
<td>43%</td>
<td>39%</td>
<td>57%</td>
<td>22%</td>
<td>48%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% of Transfers that Completed Associate Degree</td>
<td>27%</td>
<td>25%</td>
<td>26%</td>
<td>23%</td>
<td>36%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

While Latinos were the least likely to transfer, those who did were more likely to complete a transfer curriculum or degree.
Transfer Destination Varies by Race/Ethnicity

White Transfer Students
- Out-of-State Private: 40%
- For-Profit: 8%
- CSU: 38%
- In-State Private: 22%
- In-State Public: 12%
- UC: 10%

Black Transfer Students
- For-Profit: 19%
- CSU: 26%
- Out-of-State Private: 14%
- Out-of-State Public: 28%
- UC: 5%
- In-State Private: 8%

API Transfer Students
- Out-of-State Private: 5%
- For-Profit: 7%
- CSU: 45%
- Out-of-State Public: 12%
- In-State Private: 10%
- UC: 21%

Latino Transfer Students
- For-Profit: 16%
- CSU: 50%
- Out-of-State Private: 5%
- Out-of-State Public: 10%
- In-State Private: 10%
- UC: 9%

Black and Latino students twice as likely as white and API students to enroll in a for-profit institution
Some Enrollment Patterns are More Successful

- Accumulate credit early, e.g., 20+ in first year
- Pass college English/math within 2 years
- Attend full-time (or close to it)
- Take “college success” course
- Enroll continuously (don’t stop out and restart)
- Earn summer credits
- Limit course withdrawals
- Limit registering late for classes
Few Students Follow Successful Enrollment Patterns; Racial Gaps Appear Here as Well

- Passed College-Level Eng w/in 2 Yrs
- Passed College-Level Math w/in 2 Yrs
- Earned 20+ Credits Year 1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>All Degree Seekers</th>
<th>White</th>
<th>API</th>
<th>Black</th>
<th>Latino</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Passed Eng</td>
<td>36%</td>
<td>39%</td>
<td>39%</td>
<td>26%</td>
<td>33%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Passed Math</td>
<td>29%</td>
<td>30%</td>
<td>38%</td>
<td>17%</td>
<td>25%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Earned 20+</td>
<td>25%</td>
<td>27%</td>
<td>34%</td>
<td>16%</td>
<td>21%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Legend:
- All Degree Seekers
- White
- API
- Black
- Latino
Primary Recommendation: Enhance Current Efforts with Systematic Cohort Data Analysis

- CCC is well positioned for systemwide data effort
- *Divided We Fail* shows results for CCC as a whole
- Offers template for use for each college

**Milestones:**
- 2\textsuperscript{nd} term retention
- 2\textsuperscript{nd} year retention
- 12+ college credits
- 30+ college credits
- Transfer curriculum
- Certificate
- Associate degree
- Transfer – with curriculum
- Transfer – without curriculum

**Enrollment Patterns:**
- Attend full time in first term
- Take college success course
- Enroll continuously
- Pass college math w/in 2 yrs
- Pass college Engl. w/in 2 yrs
- Complete 20+ credits in first yr
- Earn summer credits
- % course withdrawals
- % course late registration
IHELP Contact Information

Reports and presentations at [www.csus.edu/ihelp](http://www.csus.edu/ihelp)
(916) 278-3888
[cvmoore@csus.edu](mailto:cvmoore@csus.edu)
[nshulock@csus.edu](mailto:nshulock@csus.edu)

Series of reports on community college student success:

*Beyond the Open Door*, August 2007
*Invest in Success*, October 2007
*It Could Happen*, February 2008
*Crafting a Student-Centered Transfer Process in CA*, August 2009
*Steps to Success*, October 2009
*Divided We Fail*, October 2010